

# Literature Review: The Impact of Hate Crimes and Incidences and Mental Health Impact on Racialized Communities in Canada

Submitted by Dr. David Este  
February 12, 2024

 Action Dignity

 STOP HATE AB

[www.stophateab.ca](http://www.stophateab.ca)

## Introduction

CTV News. (March 2023). *Hate Crimes Increase in Canada Again*. [News Article]

CBC News. (November 2023). *Reported Hate Crimes in Several Canadian Cities Higher Amid Israeli-Hamas War, Police Say*. [News Article].

Statistics Canada. (March 2023). *Police Reported Hate Crimes Rise Again as Pandemic Worsens Discrimination*. [Report]

Collectively, the three headlines above clearly signify that hate crimes has emerged as a major social issue in Canada. The two yearlong COVID-19 pandemic, the Ukraine and Russian War, along with the ongoing conflict in the Middle East are some factors that have propelled the increase in hate crimes and hate incidences in this country.

This increase has captured the attention of political parties in Canada. For example, in 2020, the Liberal Party of Canada released the following document entitled, *Forward for Everyone: A National Action Plan on Combatting Hate by 2022*. The NDP party under Jagmeet Singh called for the current federal government to confront the emerging problem of anti-Asian hate in Canada (NDP, 2022). And in the provincial election in 2022, one of the questions that was posed was the following, “How Will The Provincial Parties Address Racism And Hate?” (Global News, 2020). Very recently, the provincial government in Ontario announced that 1.7 million dollars was budgeted to fight the rise in hate crimes. The province’s solicitor general in a news release in early January 2024 stated, “acts that incite hatred, fear, and intimidation have no place in our communities” (CTV News, 2024).

Alberta, with its rapidly increased population buoyed by both inland and international migration is not immune to the practice of increasing perpetration of hate crimes as well as hate incidences. Once again, media outlets such as Global News, CTV News, CBC News, the Calgary Herald, and the Edmonton Journal have all commented in the past two years on the increase of hate crimes committed within the province. The purpose of this project was to conduct a literature review of research conducted across Canada that focused on hate crimes and hate incidences and the mental health impact of racialized communities in this country.

This report is organized in the following manner: 1) definitions and conceptualizations of hate crime and hate incidences are presented; 2) recent statistics on hate crimes and incidences in Canada and Alberta; 3) the methodology of how the search for appropriate and relevant literature was conducted; and 4) the heart of the report follows next with summaries of relevant conceptual and empirical literature focused on hate crimes and incidences in Canada. The final section includes a discussion followed by a series of recommendations.

### **Methodology**

Since this is a literature review, there are no research participants that were engaged in this process. However, during the course of this inquiry, I spoke with a number of individuals who are knowledgeable about hate crimes in Canada. After conducting at least three literature searches for relevant literature, I found a limited number of empirical research that touched briefly on the mental health impacts of hate crimes and incidences on racialized communities in Canada. The various search strategies I used are presented below:

- a) A search was conducted using Google and the terms "hate crime in Canada". The results from this search were primarily related to an array of literature that described

definitions of hate crimes and incidences, and secondly, numerical trends related to these two topics;

- b) The same process was used employing the term “hate crime incidences.” The same patterned described above emerged as a result of this search;
- c) The next set of words used were the following, “the impact of hate crimes and hate incidences on the mental health of racialized communities in Canada.” This resulted in some generalized articles dealing with the impact of hate crimes given that Canada is known as a multicultural state. Secondly, studies that focused on racialized communities had most notably the Muslim community in Canada. The research on different racialized communities was extremely limited especially articles, reports, documenting the mental health impacts of hate crimes and hate incidences;
- d) The next term that was employed was gender-based violence (GBV). Not surprisingly, there is considerable Canadian literature that focuses on GBV. However, in reviewing this body of work, it appears that the focus on the mental health of racialized communities resulting from hate crimes is not a major area of research;
- e) I then used the following phrase, “the impact of hate crimes on the mental health and wellbeing of racialized individuals and communities in Canada.” However, the results of this search basically mirrored the results that were contained in sections a and b;
- f) I then specifically searched for hate crime studies that documented the mental health impact of hate crimes on racialized individuals and communities in Alberta. The outcome of this search was positive, as there is a number of articles, reports, and an MA thesis that were discovered. However, in closely reading the content presented in these

documents, there was minimal attention given to the impact of hate crimes on the mental health of racialized communities.

- g) In the final search attempt, I used the following words, “hate crimes as a form of racism,” however, once again, there were no results that focused on this topic in Canada.

These results were confirmed during a telephone conversation with Mr. Landon Turlock on February 3, 2024. Mr. Turlock, who recently completed his MA thesis on hate crimes in Alberta and who is currently the Hate Crimes Community Liaison appointed by Alberta’s Provincial government informed me that he is not aware of any research that explores the mental health impact of hate crimes on racialized communities in Canada.

I was surprised with the paucity of literature on the topic, especially in light of current statistics that clearly identified racialized Canadians as a major group that experiences hate crimes and hate incidences. One of the questions that emerged for me is the following, *what are the reasons for the lack of research on this particular topic?* It seems to me that there is a dire need for research to be conducted on this topic. This in turn will help Canadian society develop/create services and supports required to deal with the aftermath of racialized individuals and communities that experience both hate crimes and incidences.

### **Key Definitions**

Within the literature, there are an array of definitions of the concept of hate crimes. In an early definition of the term, Wolf and Copeland (1994) stated, “violence directed towards group of people who generally are not valued by the majority of society, who suffer discrimination in other areas and who do not have access to remedy social, political, and

economic injustice” (p. 201). Barbara Perry, one of Canada’s prolific scholars on hate crimes provided the following definition of the term, “acts of violence and intimidation, usually directed towards stigmatized and marginalized groups. As such, hate crimes is a mechanism of power intended to reaffirm the precocious hierarchies that characterize a given social order. It attempts to recreate simultaneously the threatened (real or imagined) in a hegemony of the perpetrator’s group and the appropriate subordinate identity of the victim’s group” (2001, p. 10). A key feature of Perry’s conceptualization is that it recognizes that hate crimes is a structural rather than individual response to difference.

Meanwhile, Ndegwa and MacDonald (2022) put forth the following conceptualizations of hate crime, “hate crimes are criminal acts done by a person who is motivated by extreme bias or hatred towards a particular social group” (CRRF, 2000, n. p.). In a more comprehensive definition, these authors maintain, “Hate crimes is defined as a criminal violation motivated by hate, based on race, national or ethnic origin, language, colour, religion, sex, age, mental or physical disability, sexual orientation or gender identity or expression or any other similar factor” (Ndegwa & MacDonald, 2022, n. p.).

Under the Canadian Criminal Code, there are four charges that are associated with hate. These are: 1) Section 3188—Advocating genocide; 2) Section 319 (1) —Public Incitement of hatred; 3) Section 319(2) — Willful promotion of hatred; 4) Section 430 (41) – Mischief relating to religious property and educational institutions (Turlock, 2023).

A second term that emerged quite frequently in the literature focused on hate crimes is the concept of hate incidences. Mercier-Dalphon and Helly (2022) put forth the following definition of hate incidences provided by the Montreal Police Department, “any non-criminal

act that could affect the feeling of safety of a person or an identifiable group based on the prohibitive grounds of discrimination” (p. 2).

Closely related, is the term hate speech. Chetty and Abthur (2018) in explaining this term stated, “hate speech is any speech intended to hurt or disrespect an individual or group based on identity or the personal identity of the victims” (p. 34).

In any discussion centred on hate crimes, an important concept that needs to be unpacked is intersectionality. This term can be attributed to Black feminist scholars and activists such as Lorraine Hansberry (Perry, 2018) and Audre Lorde (1982), who referenced this wording in the 1950s and 1960s. The term received greater prominence in 1991 as the legal scholar Kimberle Crenshaw defined intersectionality as, “a critique of feminist and critical race scholarship and lack of race and gender. Crenshaw maintained that intersectionality is a metaphor for understanding multiple forms of inequality, especially for marginalized populations whose limited social privilege is sometimes compounded, creating obstacles that are not understood among conventional ways of thinking” (p. 1242).

Instead of thinking that individuals possess only one aspect of diversity such as race, gender, or religious faith, intersectionality stresses the need to recognize that individuals of multiple interacting identities. Cathy Davis, a sociologist from York in defining the term remarked, “intersectionality refers to the interaction between gender and race and other categories of difference in the lives, social practices, institutional arrangements and cultural ideologies and the outcomes of these interactions in terms of power” (208, p. 68). Olena Hanksivsky and Renee Cormier (2011) contend that intersectionality involves, “taking into account that social identities such as race, class, gender, ability, geography, and age interact to

form unique meanings and complex experiences within and between groups in society” (p. 217). As noted by these authors, intersectionality stresses that identity markers do not exist independently of each other. Intersectionality is a useful and essential term in understanding the ways that race, class, gender and other characteristics interact to create power differentials between groups and marginalized certain individuals through complex relationships that shape contemporary power relationships (Crenshaw, 1991; Davis, 2008; Hanksivsky & Renee Cormier, 2011).

Canadian scholar, Hanksivsky (2022) contends that the following are the major principles associated with intersectionality, 1) social justice and equity, 2) intersecting categories, 3) multi-level analysis, 4) power, 5) reflexivity, 6) time and space, and 7) awareness of diverse types of knowledge. The principle of intersecting categories is fundamental, as this maintains that human lives cannot be reduced to a single category of experience.

Intersectionality is concerned with understanding the interaction between and across various levels of society. Finally, “intersectionality values hearing and integrating the perspectives and voices of typically marginalized people such as racialized and Indigenous peoples” (Este, Sato, & Lorenzetti, 2018, p. 30).

### **Recent Statistical Information on Hate Crimes and Hate Incidences in Canada**

Ndegwa and MacDonald (2022) provide detailed statistical information on hate crimes in general and in particular these crimes that are perpetuated against racialized Canadians. They maintain that hate crimes in this country increased by 72% between 2020 and 2021. They maintain that the reasons for this increase included religious, sexual orientation, and race or ethnicity as the main causes of these hate crimes. All of the provinces and territories with the

exception of Yukon reported an increase in hate crimes during this time period. The national figures were 2696 in 2020 with 3360 reported in 2021. In relation to hate crimes and racialized communities, they increased by 6%. However, the authors clearly noted that in 2020, hate crimes against racialized people in Canada increased by over 80%. In 2021, in the advent of Covid-19, hate crimes continued to target Asian Canadian communities. For example, the Chinese Canadian National Council reported more than 900 hate crime incidences. This represented a 47% increase since 2020. A similar pattern was seen in the Arab and West Indian population with a 46% increase. Interestingly, hate crimes directed towards the Black population in Canada decreased by 5% in 2021. However, in the previous year, 2020, the percentage of hate crimes directed towards this community increased by 80%.

In a report entitled, *CEE Response Model to Hate Crimes in Alberta (2020)*, the following key findings emerged based on a survey that was conducted: 1) the sites where hate incidences took place most frequently in Alberta were 39% (Edmonton), 35% (Calgary), 13% (Lethbridge), and 12% (Wood Buffalo). The study also identified the major reasons for the motivation of hate. These included race (60%), color (48%), and religious beliefs (35%). Other motivations included place of origin (26%) and sexual orientation (32%). Finally, major sites where the incidences took place included: 58% on the streets, 42% in business shops, 33% buses/taxi, and 33% workplace and 22% educational settings. In the province of Alberta, hate crimes increased 39% from 2020 to 2021 (Statistics Canada, 2022).

However, many authors stress that many hate crimes are underreported. Hence, the statistics that are presented may not accurately represent the magnitude of the manifestation of hate crimes and hate incidences. This underreporting of hate crimes may also negatively

impact the health and wellbeing of racialized individuals and communities. For example, they may experience both short- and long-term trauma and in particular, they may remain fearful that they may be targeted again by perpetrators of hate crimes (Alberta Hate Crimes Committee, 2023).

### **The Review of the Literature**

In this section of the report, articles that provide some insights on how the mental health of racialized communities is impacted by both hate crime and incidents is provided. However, it needs to be stressed that there is very limited research that exists on the specific focus of this research. There are a few pieces that make commentary on the impact of this negative behaviour. However, in the view of this writer, the analysis that is provided is not robust nor is it in-depth. The articles that are reviewed provide some insights regarding the psychological and emotional impact of hate crimes at the individual level as well as some commentary at the community level. Based on this analysis, I contend that there is a need for more specific research that addresses the mandate of this report.

The Alberta Hate Crimes Committee (2023) published the following report, *Victimized Community Perspectives of Hate Crimes and Incidents in Alberta: 2019-2022*. The data collection methods included four focus groups, two stakeholder interviews, and a survey that was distributed in all regions of Alberta. The key finding as it relates to the focus of this report stressed that communities affected by the highest hate crimes and incidents were based on race/ethnicity, 2SLGBTQIA+, religion, those with lower incomes, people with disabilities, and the homeless (p. 1). The authors of this report also stressed that the victim of these hate crimes and incidences are impacted both emotionally and psychologically (p. 11).

In their article entitled, “Anti-Muslim violence: Hate Crime and Victimization in Canada: A Study of five Canadian cities” Mercier-Dalphon and Helly (2021) explore the victimization of Muslim individuals and the different forms of hate crime they experience. They strongly maintain that Islamophobia is a form of racism that specifically rejects Muslim culture through the perception of the religion as an inevitable part of their racial, embodied, and cultural identity.

In their discussion that reviews studies examining the effects of anti-Muslim hate crimes on recipients, they stressed that the majority of victims are hijabi Muslim women. The visibility of this clothing, in the authors’ opinion, is a key reason for the targeting of Muslim women as hate crime victims. An important part articulated by this team of researchers stresses that the consequences resulting from hate crimes not only threatens these women as individuals but as well threatens their families’ “sense of belonging while reinforcing their feelings of ostracism” (p. 4).

The next section of the article provides an historical overview of Muslims in Canada. Initially, the authors provide an overview of the Muslim community in Canada. This is followed by commentary of the Muslim experience in British Columbia, Alberta and closes with a brief piece on increasing hate experienced by Muslims in Quebec. This historical background provides the necessary context for the study the researchers conducted.

The authors utilized a qualitative research design where they completed 51 face-to-face and telephone interviews with participants from the following five urban centres in Canada: 1) Edmonton (n=12), Montreal (n=8), Quebec City (n=4), Toronto, (n=15), and Vancouver (n=7) (p. 51).

The key findings that emerged from this investigation included the following: a) women who wore the hijab are the most visible targets of hate crimes. The researchers reported that these women suffered from both verbal and sexual harassment and assault, threats of violence, and objects thrown at them (p. 7); b) the precarious nature of being a first-generation immigrant female served as a barrier for these women reporting their experience to the police (p. 8); c) the most common verbal expression of hate was captured with the following words, “go back to your country” or “we are going to deport you soon” (p. 8); d) the altering of women’s daily schedules such as attending school as well as not having the liberty to access public services (p. 9); e) male respondents maintain that a result of experiencing hate crimes, their emotional wellbeing was threatened (p. 10); f) the participants reported a lack of sense of belonging, loss of safety, and increasing fear of being a victim again (p. 10).

The following quote captured the range of impacts as reported by the study participants, “these hate acts cause Muslim Canadians to feel a loss of belonging due to their constant projection of their religion and race as ‘other’” (p. 8).

The same two authors (Mercier-Dalphonf & Helly, 2021) published the following report entitled, *Anti-Muslim Hate Crimes in Canada: Racism, Gendered Violence, and Misogyny*. This report formed the foundation for the previous article that was reviewed. Outstanding points stressed in this publication included: 1) that Islamophobia issues were quite alive and active in Canadian society; and 2) institutional factors related to systemic racism concerning hate crimes against Muslim women are manifested especially when the state does not intervene to deal with this behaviour (p. 29).

In a major report released in 2022 by Chaudhry and colleagues entitled, “Supporting Victims of Hate Crimes and Incidents” provide a detailed commentary on this subject matter. Initially, the research team provides a series of working definitions of hate crimes. Their definition is congruent with the conceptualizations of hate crimes that is presented earlier on in this report. However, the key statement that the authors make highlights, “the importance of understanding the term intersectionality in the context of hate crimes” (p. 3).

Not surprisingly, in their discussion focused on the impact of hate crimes and incidences, these authors are consistent with other scholars as they contend that hate crimes have a variety of direct impact on an individual’s emotional and psychological wellbeing. Some of these impacts may include: a) a sense of isolation; b) concealing of one’s identity out of fear of a repeated attack, c) increased vulnerability, and d) a loss of sense of security and safety. The authors also claim that there is a second type of impact that they describe as indirect victimization. The focus of this impact is the broader community. They quote Lam (2009) who spoke about this specific situation, “hate crimes and incidents target a group and are intended to send messages that cause harm to other members of the targeted group that is already marginalized” (p. 8).

One of the dominant themes that emerges in the report authored by St. Amant and colleagues (2020) stresses that racialized communities in Alberta are increasingly becoming victims of hate crimes. As far as methodology is concerned, these authors completed two surveys. The first was with a representative sample consisting of 708 individuals from Alberta’s population. The second one was a non-representative sample of 602 participants throughout Alberta. Finally, the research team conducted 78 semi-structured interviews. These interviews

were with experts, stakeholders, and victims of hate crime. St. Amant and colleagues contend that racialized communities struggle with the racial trauma caused by hate crimes. In commenting on this impact, a participant in this study remarked, “victims of racism and hate require community-based mental health support that does not require the police. Victims services must begin with the most vulnerable or targeted” (p. 18). It is important to note that in the quote above, the authors make the claim that victims of racism and hate crimes need appropriate mental health services and that the provision of victims services must ensure for example, that racialized communities are of high priority in the reception of services.

In the article, “How can community-based participatory research address hate crime and incidents,” Turlock and Mayan (2023) provide a convincing argument for using community-based participatory research as a method to examine hate crimes as well as the impact of this behaviour. Two major points are stressed in this particular work. First the authors contend that hate crimes and incidences are based on transphobia, homophobia, Islamophobia, anti-Black and anti-Indigenous racism, ableism, and sexism. As part of this discussion, Turlock and Mayan definitely speak to the importance of understanding the intersectionality of these singular forms of oppression. They are congruent with several writers who maintain that this concept is critically important in any discussion dealing with hate crimes and hate incidences.

The second major finding put forth by these authors is their claim that hate crimes and incidences can cause significant harm to both individuals and communities. They identify an array of mental health impacts stemming from hate crimes such as 1) the community feeling vulnerable and unsafe, 2) the existence of fear and anxiety, 3) concern that hate crimes will be repeated in the community, and 4) lack of trust in the community of the perpetrator (p. 63).

In this article, “Disrupting the Mantra of Multiculturalism: Hate Crimes in Canada” Perry (2015) contends that Canada is a site where hate crimes occur, and as a result threatens the myth of Canada as a multicultural state. With the proclamation of multiculturalism in 1971 and then the passing of the *Multiculturalism Act* in 1988, Perry maintains that this signalled at least ideally that Canada was a diverse and inclusive society. She maintains that multiculturalism provided a conceptual framework for how differences in Canadian society worked to be managed. From here, Perry launches into an analysis of the impact of hate crimes. As their starting point, she notes the work of British scholar Paul Iganski (2001, p. 62) who contends that there are five distinct harms associated with hate crimes. These include: 1) harm to the initial victim, 2) harm to the victim’s group, 3) harm outside the neighbourhood, 4) harm to other targeted communities, and 5) harm to societal norms and values.

Perry identified a number of impacts on the individual who is the target of hate crimes. These included 1) individuals may suffer a deep personal crisis, 2) feeling vulnerable to ongoing attacks, and 3) these individuals may possess feelings of hopelessness and helplessness. As well, she also stressed that the following impacts may be felt by the particular racialized community. First, there may be the ongoing stereotyping of the victim’s community. As well, these individuals may be afraid to associate with their community members, and hence a decrease in community solidarity. As well, these communities may also feel vulnerable to repeated attacks of hate crimes and as a result, they may be in states of constant fear. Finally, the last impact described by Perry is captured in the following words, “cultural groups that are already distant by virtue of language differences or differences of race, values, or beliefs are rendered even

more distant by virtue of fear and distrust engendered by hate crime motivated violence” (p. 26).

Perry has also published the following articles, “Disrupting the mantra of multiculturalism: Hate crimes in Canada” (2015) and “Defending the colourline- racially and ethnically motivated hate crimes” (2002). In the first publication, Perry basically highlights the following themes: 1) definition of hate crimes, and 2) a discussion focused on the impacts of hate crimes on the individual with some attention given to how these hate crimes impacted community. In the second article, once again, Perry makes two key points. First, she contends that minority group members tend to dramatically underreport that they are victims of hate crime stemming from their lack of confidence in law enforcement personnel (p. 7). The second theme highlighted by Perry is her assertion that “race is a major motivation for the manifestation of hate crimes” (p. 7).

Kennedy-Turner, Lussier, and Helly (2022) completed one of the few studies that dealt with a specific racial and religious group in Canada. Their study entitled, “A snapshot of hate: Subjective psychological distress after a hate crime: An exploration of victimization of Muslims in Canada” possessed the following two objectives: 1) to document and describe Canadian Muslims’ experiences of hate crimes including the extent, nature and context of these crimes and to examine the correlation of psychological distress; 2) to consider the impacts of being a victim of self-reported distress. The authors begin by providing some contextual information about hate crimes in the Muslim community in Canada. The following highlights were noted: 1) Muslims are the second most targeted group in terms of hate crimes. They represented 20% of all hate motivated crimes, while only representing 3.2% of the total population; and 2) Arab and

West Asian Canadians were among the visible minority groups most frequently targeted by hate crimes (p. 15). The methodology used to conduct this study is the same as reported in another article discussed in this report by Mercier-Dalphonf and colleagues (2022).

Based on a sample of 230 participants (58% women) it was found that individuals that self-identified as Muslims were three times more likely to report having been physically assaulted as well, those who self-identified as visibly Muslim reported higher levels of psychological distress. In particular, the authors speculate that the clothing being worn by these women, especially the hijab, made them easy targets for those individuals who commit hate crimes or incidences. Secondly, the authors strongly maintain that these women required supports from Canadian society to help them deal with the issues associated with these hate crimes. Finally, and perhaps the most important part of this study is the authors' recommendation who made the following point, "[there is] a need for more research on the psychological distress on [individuals and communities] who are recipients of hate crimes" (p. 1654).

In 2023, Landon Turlock completed his MA thesis entitled, *Who cares about us? Implications from survivors who reported hate crime and incidences to organizations in Edmonton*. In this study, he conducted 20 semi-structured interviews with 18 participants who reported a hate crime or incident to an organization in Edmonton during the past five years. Although this piece of work did not specifically address the impact of these behaviours on the mental health of racialized communities, he asserted that these incidents gravely impact these communities. The participants in his study maintain that they suffered emotional and psychological harm, reduce safety, fear, vulnerability, suspicion, shame, a sense of not being

welcome, fear of the perpetrator, and finally, fear that another incident may happen to other community members. A major contribution of Turlock's study is his use of a trauma-informed approach in examining hate crime in the city of Edmonton. Future research should employ this approach as racialized individuals and communities will experience different forms of trauma resulting in being victimized by hate crimes.

In the report entitled, *Responding to hate crimes and incidences in Alberta, 2020*, the authors contend that the following groups are the major recipients of hate crimes – Blacks, Arabs, West Asians, Muslims, East and South Asians, Jewish Albertans, as well as members of the LGBTQIS community. The researchers employed a qualitative research design where they conducted 124 interviews with community members and leaders. Two major themes emerged in this study. First, the authors stressed the intersectional nature of many hate crimes and incidences. They maintain that individuals who visibly belong to more than one targeted group tended to experience this negative behaviour more frequently. This finding is consistent with one of the major themes in the hate crime literature, which stresses the importance of understanding the concept of intersectionality. The second theme identified by members of the research team maintained that as a result of hate crimes, deep fractures were being created in Canadian society and as a result, the individuals who were victimized by this experience felt a decreased sense of belonging to Canada.

In her article, "Gendered Islamophobia: Hate crimes against Muslim women" Perry (add year) contends that Muslim women and girls appear to be extremely vulnerable "to violence motivated by their status as women, but especially as Muslim women" (p. 74). She maintains that as a result of 911, there have been negative constructions of Islam that have resulted in

images of Muslims that depict slanderous imagery as well as stereotyping of individuals. As a result, she contends that both of these depictions of Muslim women make them vulnerable targets of hate crimes. Perry maintains that gender motivated violence is based on widespread assumptions about gender appropriate behaviours. She also contends that violence against women is “a classic form of hate crime that terrorizes the collective by victimizing the individual” (p. 78). Finally, Perry strongly asserts that what these women experience can be described as “gender Islamophobia” (p. 78).

In her discussion describing the impact of these crimes against Muslim women, the following were highlighted: 1) these women received the message that they are out of place, forcing them to rethink their visibility in society; 2) these women also experienced the detrimental impact of racism, a lack of belonging and participation in society, as well as loss of control and sense of agency over their lives; 3) constant feeling of fear and vulnerability; 4) the need to manage their own safety over expressions of identity and independence (p. 85); 5) these women are forced out of the public purview (p. 88); and 6) fear of being alone when venturing into the public (p. 88). Perry concludes that public awareness of Islamophobic violence, and in particular gender Islamophobia needs to be increased. She also argues that there is a dire need for researchers to bring their research results, “to the street via media, and public seminars rather than confining their discussion to obscure pages of dusty refereed journal articles” (p. 86).

### **Discussion**

The final section of this report is divided into two pieces: first, a discussion is presented on the impact of hate crimes on racialized communities. This discussion is based on the

following: 1) the author's reading and thinking about the articles that were read in preparing this report; 2) the author's extensive research and writing on different racialized communities in Canada such as Filipino, Punjabi, Chinese, Black (South Sudanese), immigrants from the Caribbean, and third generation+ African Canadians; and 3) specific research projects conducted by the author that explored the psychological and emotional impact of racism on individuals, families, and at the community including sites such as Calgary, Halifax, Toronto, and Brooks Alberta.

Two consistent themes in relation to the impact of hate crimes and hate incidences prevailed in the literature. The first stressed how these behaviours negatively impacted the individual recipient. In particular, the message that was imparted is the fact that individuals may suffer emotional and psychological damage as a result of being a victim. The second theme that emerged according to several writers is the belief that the larger community of the victim may also suffer an array of psychological and emotional impacts. These sentiments are captured in the three quotes provided by Perry and Wortley-Samuels (2023):

"Hate crime is significant because of multiple levels of impact associated with it. It has a profound impact on routines, psychic, and social identification and sense of belonging on the individual victim" (p. 69).

"It is also directed at the individual's community that is designed to intimate a group of people who are differentiated from the norm" (p. 69).

"[Hate crime] is a mechanism of power, intended to reaffirm the precarious hierarchies that characterize a given social order" (Perry, 2001, p. 10).

Hate crimes can also be conceived as a form of racism. In the scholarly literature, there is an array of different definitions of the term racism that exists. Fleras and Elliot (2007) refer to racism as, “a relatively complex and organized set of ideas and ideals (ideology) that insert natural superiority of one group over another group in terms of entitlement and privileges, together with power to put these beliefs into practice in a way that denies or excludes those who belong to a devalued category” (p. 362). James (2003) provides some critical detail in his definition, “racism is the unconditional acceptance of a negative social definition of a colonized or subordinate group, typically identified by physical features (i.e., Black, Brown, Yellow, and Red). These racialized groups are believed to lack certain abilities or characteristics, which in turn constructs them as culturally and biologically inferior” (p. 136).

As previously presented in this report, a major motivator of hate crimes in Canada is the expressed hatred of a specific racial or ethnic group. Based on two studies reviewed, it is quite apparent that hate crimes against Canada’s Muslim community is on the increase. The murder of six innocent Muslims who were attending a prayer service at a local mosque in Quebec City shattered the myth of Canada as a successful multicultural nation. However, it is important to note that this incident has not deterred the manifestation of both hate crimes and incidences against the Muslim community (Nasser & McLaughlin, 2017).

According to Camara Jones (2000), there are three types of racism: institutionalized racism; personally mediated racism; and internalized racism. In her framework, she defines institutionalize racism as “differential access to the goods, services, and opportunities of society by race” (p. 1212). Many scholars (James, 2003; Bernard & Smith, 2018) maintain that this form of racism exists in all sectors of Canadian society. For example, this type of racism is manifested

in limited educational and employment opportunities, as well as the lack of adequate housing and the ongoing issue of racial profiling in racialized communities in Canada. Personally mediated racism is defined as prejudice and discrimination, “where prejudice means differential assumptions about the abilities, models, and intentions of others according to their race and discrimination means differential actions towards others according to their race” (pp. 1212-1213). Jones notes that personally mediated racism can be intentional as well as unintentional and includes acts of omission as well as acts of commission. Common forms of this type of racism include verbal or emotional abuse and harassment, the devaluing of self, the daily possibilities of physical violence and verbal confrontation. All of these behaviours leave a sense of stigma, self-doubt, and uncertainty, if not despair. Some maintain that this is a form of trauma. The final form of racism is internalized racism, which is defined as, “acceptance by members of the stigmatized race of negative messages about their own abilities and intrinsic worth” (p. 1213). The perpetration of hate crimes possesses the ability for recipients of this behaviour to experience all three forms of racism.

Essed (1991) and Root (1993) stress the importance of vicarious racism as central to understanding for example, how hate crimes negatively impact individuals. However, Harrell (2000) points to the need to include not only those direct personal experiences of this form of racism but also those experiences that happens to other community members, which she identifies as vicarious racism experiences – that is events such as hate crimes incidents that exert their influence on their community through observation and reports of others. As noted by Harrell (2000), these are situations that create anxiety, a heightened sense of danger and

vulnerability, anger, sadness, alongside other emotional and psychological reaction as experienced by individuals as well as the collective itself.

Hate crimes may also be conceptualized as a form of race-related stress. Harrell (2000) maintains that racism-related events such as hate crimes and incidences may be stressors that racialized people encounter on a regular basis. Hence, hate crimes based on Harrell's work can make both individual as well as racialized communities feel demoralized, disrespectful and dehumanized.

Nursing scholar Josephine Enang (2002) maintained that racism creates feelings of powerlessness and/or self-esteem that have an impact on health, happiness, and life chances. In a 2010 publication published by James and colleagues entitled, *Race and Well-Being: The Lives, Hopes and Activism of African Canadians*, an entire chapter is devoted to examining the impact of racism on the well-being of African Canadian men, their families, and at a community level in Halifax, Toronto, and Calgary. Of particular importance is the detailed information provided by the study's participants on how this insidious behaviour impacts both their psychological and emotional health. As well, the authors also noted that racism also affects the individuals' physiological status.

I would expect similar results to the study above if there were explicit studies that focused on the mental health impacts of hate crimes and incidences on racialized communities in Canada. It would be imperative for these studies to hear directly from a range of different racialized communities (e.g., Black, Chinese, Filipino) so that we will have an enhanced and in-depth understanding of hate crimes and their impact.

### **Recommendations**

This second section contains a series of recommendations that stems directly from the author's review of the literature that examined to a certain extent the impact of hate crimes and incidences on individuals and to a lesser extent on their communities.

1. In conducting this literature review, it became readily apparent that there is a dire need for research that addresses the following question: "what are the mental health impacts on racialized communities in Canada that experience both hate crimes and hate incidences?" It is critical that this research is conducted for a number of reasons. As stressed by several of the authors who have conducted research on hate crimes and hate incidences in Canada/ Alberta, they acknowledge that this behaviour impacts the recipients of these behaviours both emotionally and psychologically. Research that is focused on the questions posed will provide a more robust understanding of the mental health and well-being of the recipients of these hate crimes including how they impact different racialized communities in Canada. In particular, this research needs to address not only the individual impacts of hate crime, but as well, participants in this proposed research must also respond to the question, "what is the impact of hate crimes on your community?" For the most part, the research that has been conducted to date is limited in its utility for those individuals, groups, and organizations who are in the position of providing help to those individuals in communities who have been the recipients of hate crimes and incidences. The results of this focused research will help service providers develop programs and services that address the specific mental health concerns of racialized communities.
2. Closely associated are a series of three additional research questions that in this writer's opinion also must be part of the research inquiry: A) Who do you turn to for supports and

services after you have experienced a hate crime and incidences? Some of this information currently exists. However, the research must ensure that we hear from members of racialized communities both in Canada and Alberta. This will also provide information regarding the extent of the service delivery system that exists for those who have been recipients of hate crimes. B) How helpful were the supports/services that you utilized to help you deal with the impact of hate crimes or incidences? Outside of Turlock's (2023) study, where he concluded that organizations in Edmonton that received complaints of hate crimes were not very effective in providing assistance to those who reported being victims of hate crimes, there is virtually no literature that exists that evaluates the provision of supports/services for victims of hate crimes. It is imperative that we begin to understand from an intervention perspective what works, what does not work, and what changes needed to be implemented. C) What types of supports/services do you think is needed to help recipients of hate crimes and incidents? This question is directed to hearing from those who have been impacted from such negative behaviours. It is crucial that we hear from these individuals to ensure the development of appropriate supports and services. Hence from a service delivery perspective, what is being advocated here is the development of programs that are not initiated from the top but instead are created with the input of those directly impacted by hate crimes and incidences. D) It is imperative to ensure that there is a designated service provider in each major city/region in Alberta that possesses the ability to address the mental health needs of both individuals/communities who both experience hate crimes and incidences. For service providers, this means that these individuals will have 1) a solid understanding of what is hate crimes and incidences, 2) how this behaviour

impacts the individual recipient, and in particular, psychologically and emotionally, and 3) the impact at the community level and in particular racialized communities. If the staff receive training in these areas, it is highly likely that they will be able to respond to both individuals and at the community level appropriately.

### References

- Alberta Hate Crimes Committee. (2023). *Victimized Community Perspectives of Hate Crimes and Incidents in Alberta: 2019-2022*. Calgary, Alberta.
- Bryan, T. (2019). *Race, diversity, and the politics of hate crimes: An analysis of police response to racially motivated hate crimes in the Greater Toronto Area*. PhD Thesis, York University. Toronto, Ontario.
- Erentzen, C., & Schuller, R. (2022). Exploring the dark figure of hate: Experiences with police bias and the underreporting of hate crime. *Canadian Journal of Criminology and Criminal Justice*, 62(2), 64–87.
- Este, D., Lorenzetti, L., & Sato, C. (2018). *Race and anti-racism in Canada*. Fernwood Press.
- Fleras, A., & Elliot, J. (2007). *Unequal relations: An introduction to race, ethnic and Aboriginal dynamics in Canada*. Pearson Press.
- Harrell, S. (2000). A multi-dimensional conceptualization of racism-related stress: Implications for the well-being of people of colour. *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry*, 70(1), 42–57.

James, C. E. (2003). *Seeing ourselves: Exploring race, ethnicity, and culture* (Third edition).

Thompson Educational Publishing.

Jones, C. (2000). Levels of racism: A theoretical framework: A gardener's tale. *American Journal of Public Health* 90(8), 1212–1215.

Kennedy-Turner, K., Cote-Lussier, C., & Helly, D. (2023). A snapshot of hate: Subjective psychological distress after a hate crime: An exploratory study on victimization of Muslims in Canada. *Journal of Muslim Mental Health*, 17(1).

<https://doi.org/10.3998/jmmh.480>

Lorde, A. (1982). *Zami! A new spelling of my name*. Crossing Press.

Martin, J. (2020). Eliminate hate: Hate crimes and hate speech in Canada. *Journal of Intelligence, Conflict, and Warfare*, 3(1), 33–46.

McCoy, J., Jones, D., & Hastings, Z. (2019). *Building awareness, seeking solutions: Extremism and hate-motivated violence in Alberta*. Organization for the Prevention of Violence, Edmonton, AB.

Mercier-Dalphon, G., & Helly, D. (2021a). Anti-Muslim hate crime in Canada: Racism, gendered, and misogyny. *Actualities, Justice*, 36(1), 29–32.

Mercier-Dalphon, G., & Helly, D. (2021b). Anti-Muslim violence, hate crime and victimization in Canada: A study of five Canadian cities. *Canadian Ethnic Studies*, 53(1), 1–22.

Nasser, S., & McLaughlin, A. (2017, February 17). *Protesters outside Masjid Toronto: Call for ban on Islam as Muslims pray inside*. CBC News.

Ndewgwa, A., & McDonald, S. (2022). *Hate crimes in Canada*. Government of Canada. Victims of Crime Research Digest, 16.

- Perry B. (2001). *In the name of hate: Accounting for hate crime*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Perry, B. (2002). Defending the color line: Racially and ethnically motivated hate crime. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 46(1), 72–92.
- Perry, B. (2010). Policing hate crime in a multicultural country: Observations from Canada. *International Journal of Law, Crime, and Justice*, 38(3), 120–140.
- Perry, B. (2014). Gendered Islamophobia: Hate crimes against Muslim women. *Social Identities: Journal for the Study of Race, Nation, and Culture*, 20(1), 74–89.
- Perry, B. (2015). Disrupting the mantra of multiculturalism: Hate crime in Canada. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 59(15), 1637–1654.
- Perry, I. (2018). *Looking for Lorraine: The radiant and radical life of Lorraine Hansberry*. Beacon Press.
- Perry, I., & Samuels-Wortley, T. (2021). We're not where we should be: Enhancing law enforcement responses to hate crime. *Canadian Journal of Criminology and Criminal Justice*, 63(2), 68–98.
- St. Amant, M., McCoy, J., & Adhan, M. (2020). *Hate in Alberta: Problems to solutions*. Organization for the Prevention of Violence, Edmonton, AB.
- Turlock, L. (2023). *Who cares about us? Insights and implications from survivors who reported hate crimes and incidences to organizations in Edmonton*. MA Thesis in Community Engagement – School of Public Health, University of Alberta.
- Turlock, L., & Mayan, M. (2023). How can community-based participatory research address hate crimes and incidences? *Engaged Scholar Journal*, 9(1), 61–75.



**For more information on hate crimes in Canada  
and how you can help make a difference,  
please visit:**



[www.stophateab.ca](http://www.stophateab.ca)